ECA/PHSD/HRP/91/9/5.2(O.A.)(b)

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR AFRICA
PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION, HUMAN RESOURCES
AND SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT DIVISION

REPORT OF THE WORKSHOP ON MANAGEMENT OF PROGRAMMES OF TRAINING AND ORGANIZATIONAL DEVELOPMENT, NIPA, ZAMBIA, 16-20 SEPTEMBER, 1991

September, 1991

INTRODUCTION

1. The workshop was organised jointly by the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (ECA) and the National Institute of Public Administration (NIPA). The ECA provided a resource person, Dr. Mushiba Nyamazana, at no cost to the Zambian government, and NIPA paid for tea breaks, lunches and provided secretarial and other logistical services. The local course director, Mr Coillard Hamabuyu, did a very excellent job with regard to the provision of the necessary logistical support for the smooth conduct of the workshop.

ATTENDANCE

2. The workshop was attended by middle- and high- level training and manpower officers from the Zambian Civil-Service and the Zambia Industrial and Mining Corporation (ZIMCO) Group of Companies (parastatal companies).[1]

OFFICIAL OPENING OF THE WORKSHOP

3. In his welcoming remarks, the Deputy Principal of NIPA, Mr. N.M.J. Ngulube, started by saying that NIPA was proud to host such a seminal workshop despite its resource constraints. In his view, management is both a resource and a service and, as such, management development generates value in the organisation's life cycle. That organisations are prepared to incur costs when they invest in the most valued resources - people - signifies that such investment produces something of value which, ultimately, pays back more than the initial costs incurred. Investment in human resources also acts to enhance motivation.

4. Mr. Ngulube went on to say that in order to assess the value of management development and training, there is need to monitor and evaluate such programmes with the view to improving the management development processes. He then wondered as to what kind of managers the participants were: risk-takers who are prominent when an organisation is born or reborn or caretakers who have worked for their respective organisations when the latter is in danger of winding up? Such a distinction, in his view, was necessary as management development programmes ought to respond to the challenges posed by " risk-

[1]See the list of participants in the appendix for the exact titles.

takers" and at the same time, the "caretaker" managers could continue to provide facilitator services.

5. He reiterated further that in future, NIPA will concentrate on offering short-term training programmes to middle-level management -- such as the participants-so as to make them less content with maintaining the status quo and, to instead, become aggressive and innovative.

6. In his opening remarks, the guest of honour, Mr. R. J. Lungu, Assistant Director, Directorate of Manpower Development and Training (DMDT), Cabinet Office, expressed appreciation at the collaborative effort between the ECA and NIPA at organising such an important workshop. He recalled that since the 1976 National Trainers Workshop at NIPA the ECA had not held a similar workshop in Zambia.

7. He reminded the audience that human resources development is of critical importance in the economic development of any nation. He further argued that a lot of complaints have, the world over, been levelled against the civil - service. This, in his view, entails that trainers should investigate the causes of such inadequacies so as to map out the right course of action that would minimise the incidence of such ineptness.

8. In the context of training, the foregoing implies a process of identifying training needs, designing appropriate training programmes and evaluating the impact of training. This process, simple as it may sound, is a major task but which, in most cases, is underrated by top management in many organisations. In many organisations, he went on, not only is training given lip-service but was also under-staffed, and poorly resourced. However, he noted with gratitude that many organisations, including the Government of the Republic of Zambia, have come to realise the importance of human resources development in socio-economic development and transformation. It has become more than clear, over the years, that improving the human resources base by increasing its effectiveness can lead to better economic management and, thereby, increase the national welfare. It is against this background that exposing the participants to management and organisational development techniques would help their respective organisations to design relevant training programmes which are responsive to the changing socio-economic and political environment.

9. The value of organisation development training, he went on, was not only confined to the few individual trainees but rather to the fact that the training took a problem - solving approach with a view to determining training needs of either a government ministry or a parastatal company from which the participants were drawn.

10. He expressed pleasure at the content of workshop which, in his view, seemed to cover some of the most critical issues which, in the advent of plural politics in Zambia, pose a challenge to the smaller civil-service in general and to trainers in particular. Expectations among the general public has been raised to the point that they require an efficient public sector which could only be attained through improvement of human resources.

11. He concluded his speech by saying that the government will continue to support NIPA's efforts in conducting such short-term skill-oriented training programmes. He, also, extended, on behalf of the Zambian Government, a special welcome to the ECA's resource person. He further hoped that such collaborative efforts will continue so as to improve institutional links between the ECA and Zambia's government agencies. With the foregoing remarks, he declared the workshop officially opened.

ACCOUNT OF PROCEEDINGS

DAY I

12. The ECA resource person started by telling participants that the morning plenary sessions were to be confined to presentation of papers and/or concepts. The mid-morning and afternoon sessions were, on the other hand, to be devoted to group discussion (of specific empirical issues) and presentation of group reports, respectively. The NIPA course co-ordinator, Mr. Hamabuyu, further reminded the participants that the main role of the ECA resource person and himself was to facilitate the discussions and that the participants should feel free to contribute to the discussions.

13. The ECA resource person then presented the first paper of the workshop "management development and organisation development". He started by outlining the objectives of the workshop which were as follows:

(a) to clarify the meaning of management development (MD), managerial training and organisation development (OD);

(b) to familiarise the participants on the role of management and organisation in development;

(c) to review and appraise participants on planning and implementing staff training programmes;

(d) to analyze the determinants of training needs and the determinants of the modes of delivery of training programmes; and

(e) to familiarise participants on the techniques for monitoring and evaluating staff training programmes.

14. He then proceeded to define the concept of management development as "the improvement of an individual's present performance and preparing the same individual for higher responsibilities in future". To the extent that such management development implied the acquisition of management skills the ECA resource person defined the concept of skill as being "the ability to perform a task to required standards with a minimum of unnecessary effort". He further argued that the operational characteristic of a skill is the ability to perceive slight changes in the task and to respond appropriately from time to time. By implication, therefore, the acquisition of a skill meant improving one's performance of a given task.

15. To the extent that managerial training facilitates the learning process through imparting direct and indirect knowledge on the trainees, the ECA resource person argued that the basic starting point for planning and improving management training programmes is the job descriptions itself. The resource person further went on to enumerate the factors which makes management development necessary: increased competition resulting from an expanding economy; rapid growth in size and location of plants (decentralized structure of production); changes in technology; changes in government regulations; and executive development.

16. As management development affects organisational effectiveness through increased motivation and performance, it also affects how the different individuals who form the organisation relate to each other. This means that each organisation has a unique internal work culture which influences the behaviour or practices of both the management and the workers. This internal work culture is also influenced by the external operating environment: the economic, legal, technological, political and cultural factors.

17. Within a given organisation, the ECA resource person argued, the basic approaches to management development would entail, in addition to formal external training, the following: job rotation to give the incumbents a wider perspective of the operations of the organisation; creating of "assistant - to" positions to understudy senior managers; and through temporary promotion such as acting when substantive managers are away.

18. With regard to the concept of organisation development, (OD) the resource person defined it as a planned activity or organisation wide effort managed from the top and directed at increasing organisational effectiveness by intervening in the organisational process using behavioral scientific knowledge and techniques. Some of the techniques include, among other things, job enrichment, team building, motivation, etc. OD therefore aims at helping members of an organisation to interact more effectively in pursuit of organisational goals. As such, organisation development seeks to harmonise individual employee goals with those of the organisation: This premise is based on the following:

(a) organisations do not exist as ends in themselves but rather as means to the end of fulfilling the needs of individuals in a society;

(b) there should be congruence between individual goals and organisational needs; and

(c) better inter-personal relationships will make it easier to achieve an organisation's goals.

The organisation development process was then said to consist of the following stages:

(i) the entry stage where the preliminary needs assessment, programme design commitment building, etc. are done;

(ii) the diagnostic stage which determines an organisation's strengths and weaknesses;

(iii) change stage where intervention is made through programme design, problem-solving, team building, conflict resolution, strategic planning, etc;

(iv) evaluation stage where results of a new regime are compared with those of the old one; and

(v) the follow-up stage which is used to sustain the improvements made during the organisation development programme.

19. The important features of organisation development were then listed to further put the above analysis into perspective. The integral relationship between MD and OD was further emphasised. Finally, the presentation looked at the advantages and limitations of OD and its future prospects.

20. After the foregoing presentation, the workshop then broke into two groups to discuss the following questions:

Group A

In the context of Zambia's unstable and deteriorating economic situation, what are the likely consequences on management development and organisational development? How can these consequences be mitigated?

Group B

In the light of the contraction of Zambian civil-service, is management and organisation development possible ? Discuss with a view to making policy recommendation.

GROUP REPORTS

21. Outlined hereunder is a summary of the group report and the discussion of the reports that followed their presentation in the plenary session:

ZAMBIA'S ECONOMIC SITUATION AND ITS IMPACT ON MANAGEMENT AND ORGANIZATION DEVELOPMENT

22. Ever since Zambia's independence, priority sectors such as agriculture have not been emphasised and hence the current economic problems. Further, Zambians are not generally inclined to working harder.

23. In general terms an unstable and deteriorating economic situation makes planning complex as prediction is difficult; monitoring and evaluations have to be done more often -- all of which increase the costs of implementing the planning activity. While the foregoing is true, it cannot be used as an excuse for not planning as long- and short- term plans can be instituted to achieve both short- and long- term objectives and to react to changes in the budgetary situation.

24. To the extent that training is budgeted for, a rise in training costs can be taken into account by adjusting the size of the training programmes so as to concentrate on those who

need training most. Alternatively, other sources of training could be explored even if these may not be ideal. For example, if university training cannot be afforded, a company may opt for college training. Under such circumstances, abandoning training activity is of no consequence as it will only further act to weaken the organization. Even under budgetary constraints, training should not be put as the last on the priority list. As an unstable and deteriorating economy affects labour turnover and consequently organizational and management development, the source of labour turnover has to be identified: i.e. whether voluntary or not. If it is voluntary, the organization should institute incentives so as to improve skilled manpower retention. The more trained labour is kept, the more likely it is to reduce further training costs and thereby improve performance. Since labour turnover is much pronounced among high level manpower (HLM) than at lower levels - mainly because the former is general as opposed to specific skills of the latter - pay incentives and other perks are of paramount importance in utilizing high level manpower.

25. Many people in Zambia are of the belief that being sent for training is, in itself, an indication that they will be promoted on their return. Rarely, if ever, is it made clear to such people that training is meant to improve their current performance and to prepare them for higher responsibilities in future - depending on whether vacancies will exist at the higher levels. It is necessary therefore, to introduce career counselling so as to reduce unnecessary turnover.

26. Under conditions of a deteriorating economy or changing technology, experience may become redundant and, as such, management development is necessary for introducing new management techniques which will allow the organization to react and adapt to changing circumstances.

27. That management development managers (referred to usually as training managers) are often lowly placed in the hierarchy, it makes the integration of manpower development difficult as these are not represented at the highest level (and if not negatively viewed by top management). There is, therefore, the need for integrating human resources issues in the organizational plans for, without this, organizational effectiveness will be adversely affected.

28. In summary, we can itemise the consequences of Zambia's poor economic performance on MD and OD:

(a) training budgets are likely to suffer in which case the quality of human resources in general and management in particular will fall -- hence poor performance;

(b) to the extent that training helps career advancement, lack of it may encourage labour turnover.

To mitigate the above, training needs to be highly placed on the priorities list and to enlighten top management on the value of human resources management and the need for integrating this function in the planning process.

29. One of the participants in the group graphically described how human resources development of non-managerial staff is underrated in one organisation: the training officers were placed below assistant personnel manager (training) through whom the former has to communicate recommendations regarding training of staff to the personnel manager. When it comes to raising cheques for paying training expenses of non-managerial staff, top management is usually very un-cooperative to the extent that there have been particular instances where it was not possible to send staff for training due to the delay in the process of issuing cheques. However, when it comes to training courses which involve top management -- especially if it is abroad, where the cost to the company is even higher, no similar problems are experienced.

30. Another participant said that the low priority accorded to training is reflected by the fact that the training budget is usually the first to be subjected to cutting when financial difficulties are experienced. It was this particular practice which tended to undermine OD as it reduced the effectiveness of staff.

31. On the issue of short- and long- term planning, another participant said that this should instead be done in three phases; namely operational (which lasts up to 3 months); tactical (mid-term - which lasts from 3 months to one year) and strategic (long-term, i.e. one year and over). With regard to whether university or college education should be preferred in the context of budgetary constraints a participant from NIPA said that the institution has refrained from sending staff for long-term post-graduate training as it is not in a position to offer competitive conditions of service to retain such graduates. Instead the institution sends its staff for short-term courses which are more specific to the needs of NIPA -- i.e., change the type of training from being general to specific. The ECA resource person pointed out that, the foregoing contribution missed the point as the issue was to consider other alternatives (the second best) under conditions of reduced training resources. This point was further expanded on by a participant from the Natural Resources Development College (NRDC). He said that it was often the case that some organisations responded to individual employee training needs and not to organisation training needs. The participant from the Management Services Board (MSB) observed that training needs should be based on what the organisation

needs and determine whether the incumbents can meet those needs. It might so happen that training is not always the answer.

32. On the question of protecting training expenditure from being drastically cut in the context of budgetary constraints under a top management which does not rate training highly, one participant wanted to know how one goes about to convince such a management not to cut the training budget? In the discussion of this question the following conclusions emerged:

(i) training proposals should be in line with the organization's policy in order for top management to support the implementation of such proposals;

(ii) make top management involved in the actual training process and, where possible, select them for training so as to demonstrate to them, at the personal level, the value of training.

(iii) if the training budget has to be cut, the priority and strategic training programmes should not be compromised; and

(iv) the importance of investing into human resources should be demonstrated. For example, by carrying out a survey of training needs of the organization it can be demonstrated to top management that without further training activity, the effectiveness of the organization will be compromised.

MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT AND ORGANISATIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN THE ZAMBIA CIVIL SERVICE: POLICY RECOMMENDATION

1. PROBLEMS IDENTIFIED

- Lack of accountability
- Lack of terms of reference
- Lack of training policy
- Misplacement of manpower
- Poor conditions of service
- Red tape
- Political interference

2. RECOMMENDATIONS

(a) To institute manpower policy by:-

- Carrying out a Training Needs Survey (Analysis) in order to identify manpower potential. This survey should be carried out at all levels of the organisation i.e.

  - Lower and middle Management Level
  - Top Management Level

(b) To implement sound training programmes through:-

- Conducting In-Service Training (on-the-job training)
- Sending staff to formal training institutions
- To print and publish training manual for employees as a training guide.

(c) To review the existing personnel policy so as to facilitate:-

- Introducing an effective Personnel Manual which should embrace job categories, qualifications and experience pertaining to each job.

- Drawing up new terms of reference for each job category to ensure effective accountability and communication.

(d) To offer attractive conditions of service so as to retain the labour force through:-

- attractive salaries
- motivation and incentives such as good accommodation, access to loans, recreation facilities, canteen, medical, funeral, transport, good pension package, etc.

(e) To remove political interference so as to ensure smooth operation of the service.

CONCLUSION

33. We are recommending a Civil Service which will make things happen, get things done and produce the required results. In this type of environment therefore, Management Development and Organisational Development are possible.

34. In discussing this group report, the ECA resource person disputed the scheme of the presentation as, in his view, it failed to bring out the issues related to MD and OD. He also disputed the notion of total removal of political interference as there was no civil service in the world which was immune from the political process - i.e., the civil service is supposed to serve the government of the day. The Group Chairman responded by saying that by reducing political interference, they meant the stopping of political appointments of top civil servants to be replaced by a system based on merit and professionalism.

35. A participant from ZIMCO argued that a reduction in the civil-service may increase the workload and as such further recruitment may be necessary. Other participants also wondered that given the duplicity of work and red tape, it was not clear as to whether the reduction in the civil service will solve the problem. That is, it is the lower occupational categories, not necessarily the middle and higher levels (the base for red tape) which will be cut the most.

36. Another participant from NRDC felt that since the civil-service was pre-occupied with accountability -- that is, identify who decided what -- it takes a very long time to make even a smallest decision. If reduction of personnel were to be done appropriately, it will not necessarily increase the workload but reduce the repetition of the same job. As for the NIPA participant, he felt that the reduction of the civil-service is a fallacy as certain categories are in short-supply and others like personnel are over-supplied. The participant from the Management Services Board reminded the other participants that the reduction of the civil service was due to budgetary constraints and not necessarily to improve management

development and organisation development. As such, any impact on management development and organisation development (if any) will be accidental and not necessarily a deliberate (planned) one.

DAY II

37. The local resource person who should have presented a paper on "Planning and Implementing Staff training Programmes" did not turn up. The ECA resource person had to lead the discussion. He started by saying that the concept of planning has two elements: forecasting plus a deliberate choice of a particular course of action to achieve a given goal. Forecasting involves making the occurrence of an event contingent on certain assumptions holding. For example, if a company assumes that 10 per cent of its middle management level staff will leave over the coming year and, as such, it should spend a given amount on training to keep the system stable, that is a forecast and not a plan. But when this is, in addition, combined with the firm stating that it will use internal as opposed to external training to achieve its target, this would constitute planning.

38. In general, firms forecast manpower wastage, production levels, workload, market conditions, etc. On the basis of these forecasts, the firms try to estimate their future skill requirements. The firm has to decide whether to use general or specific training, long or short-term training programmes; internal or external training; etc. The final method chosen to develop the necessary skills will depend on its efficiency and cost-effectiveness

39. On the issue of implementing training, many participants felt that external foreign training was usually preferred to local training not necessarily because the former was superior but because of the value system. This preference could also be attributed to the fact that much of the technology used is imported. A problem, however, does emerge when one firm uses competing technologies. While rotating the technologists on the various technologies should be the solution, the best option was to choose only one process so as to reduce potential complications -- but this is impracticable in the context of being a "beggar" as aid donations cannot be turned down even if that means introducing competing processes.

40. Some participants from the civil-service and ZIMCO companies felt that given manpower data problems, it was very difficult to make realistic forecasts. To overcome this problem, SIDA is funding a manpower information project in the Ministry of Health to identify who is where, what they are doing and at what levels.

41. It was further observed that there is no co-ordination of the different government agencies on manpower information. As such, there is a tendency to concentrate on training at the detriment of other manpower aspects such as wastage analysis. The task of manpower planning is made all the more difficult by the lack of a clear-cut manpower policy which could be used as a guide. Other problems which afflict manpower planning are under-funding, duplicity of efforts, and the lack of interest shown by Cabinet Office in manpower policy suggestions submitted by the Ministries. The administration of scholarships has become so meaningless that some senior officials were now extending scholarships to their own family members. Further, the current training priorities in the civil-service were drawn in 1983 and there has been no review ever since to make it possible to update these priorities so as to reflect the changed socio-economic circumstances.

42. On the issue of following up on training, the participant from ZIMCO Institute of Management said that the institute has a budget it uses to make a follow-up on its graduates to see how they perform on the job with a view to offering refresher courses should these be found to be necessary. In some cases, some employers write to the Institute to express their appreciation of the quality of its training (ZIMCO Institute). In this participant's view, what enhances the relevance of the institutes training is the counselling service which it provides to its graduates. With regard to the civil-service, the participant said that many candidates were sent to his institute for training when they did not qualify for such training. This raises questions as to how trainees are chosen in the civil service.

43. It was also observed that performance appraisal was not done in the civil-service and, as such, a follow-up on the quality of training received so as to advise training institutes was not possible.

DAY III

44. The ECA resource person presented a paper on "The Analysis and Determinants of Training needs in an organisation or an enterprise". The presentation started by recouping the definition of the concept of training and then proceeded to discuss the analysis of training needs. Training analysis was necessary as it increased productivity; improves career advancement; etc. Training needs can be determined by comparing what is actually going on with what should ideally be the expected level of performance.

45. It is necessary that the jobs and the people who need training are identified. This can be accomplished through the following methods:

(i) Analysis of equipment: at the time when new equipment or modification to equipment is done, an assessment of this on the skill requirements should be done. Among other things, the differences between the new and old equipment should be identified to determine whether existing skills are adequate. If not, there may be a need for training.

(ii) Analysis of behaviour: training needs can also result from an analysis of employee behaviour. For example, spoilage, absenteeism, resentment towards instruction, etc; may indicate the need for corrective action through training.

(iii) Analysis of an organisation: here the analysis should concentrate on the failure to achieve stated goals, whether goals are clearly stated; whether planning is clearly done, etc. This may give clues as to whether training is necessary or not.

(iv) Performance appraisal: this is usually the commonest method used to determine whether an individual requires training or not - i.e., an individual's performance, if correctly done, will be the best way of determining whether an individual needs training or not.

Other methods of determining training needs include the use of committees; consultants; counselling; informal talks, interviews; etc.

46. After the training needs have been identified the next step will involve determining the training content. That is, what has to be learned and how best this should be brought about. The training content will be determined by the "performance differential", that is, the difference between what you want your trainees to be able to do and what they are, actually, able to do before training.

47. Selection of the training media follows after the performance differential has been identified. At this stage, the media which will produce the greatest learning in the shortest time will be sought. That is, should it be internal or external training; group or individual training, etc. The cost-benefit of each media should be carefully studied so as to pick up the most optimum one.

48. In the second session, Mr. M.T Ng'uni of the University of Zambia made a presentation on "Training Aids, instructional methods approaches and techniques". He started by saying that the value of training is measured through how much a trainee absorbs and not by how much a trainer talks. He argued that one has to determine the amount of resources

needed to deliver a particular training programme. The educational media (teaching aids, techniques and methods) we require for delivery of a training programme should also be determined. In Zambia, he opined, problems abound with regard to the use of educational technology media - especially maintenance of the equipment.

49. He defined educational technology as a systematic approach to designing and evaluating learning and teaching methods and the exploitation and application of media and of current knowledge of communication techniques in education. He then said that curriculum development is referred to as the technology of education and the hardware and software used is referred to as the technology in education.

50. The reasons for using educational technology are as follows:

(a) it is effective in illustrating the subject matter;
(b) it attracts attention of the trainees;
(c) it complements and supplements verbal expressions;
(d) media has a universal understandable language;
(e) it encourages learner participation.

51. He cited evidence which showed that sight accounts for about three-quarters of the learning process -- especially the retention of information. He then listed the types of educational media used. Among the non-projected media are the chalk board, charts, models, real objects, displays, etc.; and among the projected, there are film projectors, television, computers and over-head projectors. Advantages and disadvantages of each category were then discussed. For the non-projected media, their main advantage was that they did not require electric power or light sources. As such they could be used anywhere and were, in addition, cheaper to purchase. The main advantages of the projected media were as follows:

(a) infinite variety of size, shape, colour and appeal;
(b) can be easily produced by the trainer;
(c) much of the materials used are locally available;
(d) easy to alter and/or amend;
(e) easily adaptable to the requirements of any subject; and
(f) it gives the trainees an opportunity to participate.

52. In the light of the foregoing presentation, he then proceeded with showing the participants the different media (over-head projector, slides, audio-video equipment, etc), and how they were used in the training process. In the afternoon, the venue was changed to NIPA's teaching laboratory where a film on visual aids which demonstrated the importance

of sight in the learning process was shown. The film also showed some basic ways of making effective in-house visual aids, which can be used for training. In discussing the film, some participants pointed out that visual aids can be effective in certain circumstances. They cited the case of the over-head projector which could switch off trainees. To the extent that some of the participants admitted that they had equipment which they did not know how to operate, it was therefore considered necessary to devote the whole afternoon to the demonstration of teaching aids. Consequently, there were no group discussions.

DAY IV

53. A paper on the "Evaluation of Staff Training Programmes" was presented by the ECA resource person. He started by defining the concept of evaluation as being a process of determining, systematically and objectively, the relevance, effectiveness and impact of activities in the light of their objectives. Evaluation was said to be an organisational tool for improving activities still in progress and for aiding management in future planning, programming and decision-making. From the outset, participants were reminded that evaluation of training was not an easy task. It poses difficulties in terms of resources, time and scope. Evaluation can be biased by personal reactions of participants, unreliable data due to invalid instruments, and it may be difficult to distinguish between the impact of training and other intervening factors which may have contributed to the change in the workers' effectiveness. Quantitative as well as qualitative data are necessary in order to make conclusions regarding impact of training.

54. The objectives of the paper were to acquaint participants with the concept of evaluation; to give participants practical orientation in the process and techniques for conducting evaluation; and to give the participants an overview of the process and techniques of evaluating management and organisational development programmes as well as their associated problems.

55. The presentation then reviewed the literature on evaluation. It cited Warr, Bird and Rackham (1970) who consider two basic aspects of evaluation: input and output evaluation. Input evaluation considers such questions as 'what procedures are most likely to bring about changes?' It covers such questions as which training approach to take, content and format of training, and the type of trainer, etc. Outcome evaluation is concerned with identifying changes which have occurred as a result of training. Hamblin (1974), on the other hand, defined evaluation as an attempt to obtain information (feedback) on the effects of a training programme and to assess the value of the training in the light of that information.

56. On the other hand, Kirkpatrick (1976) broke the evaluation process into four logical steps:

Step 1: Reaction - how well did the trainees like the training programme?

Step 2: Learning - What concepts, skills and attitudes were learned in the training programme?

Step 3: Behaviour - What changes in job behaviour resulted from the training programmes? and

Step 4: Results - What were the tangible results of the programme in terms of reduced cost, improved quality and quantity, etc.- i.e., has training contributed to a more effective and efficient organisation.

57. These stages were fully explained to the participants and the problems likely to be encountered at each stage were discussed.

58. The analysis then concentrated on the evaluation of organisational development (OD) interventions. Participants were told about two distinct methods of evaluating OD programmes:

(a) reports by consultants who managed the OD interventions. There is, however, the problem of such consultants seeking to publish respectable evidence of the success of their own interventions.

(b) use of multiple-choice questionnaires to survey a large number of managers and employees in order to identify whether changes have taken place across the organisation as a result of OD interventions or the operation of management development systems. This should be complemented by other organisational performance data (such as absenteeism, sales figures, customer complaints, etc.)

59. Reasons were then given as to why it is necessary to use different evaluation methods. These ranged from differences in management styles to the difficulty of distinguishing between actions undertaken as part of the intervention.

60. With regard to the evaluation of management development, the most commonly used method is that of management development audit. It is a fact-finding and evaluation exercise which provides a comprehensive picture of management development within an organisation. The audit usually starts by identifying the official management development policy. This is followed by a questionnaire to evaluate what happens in practice as opposed to theory; the effectiveness of management development evaluations of existing programmes; and what changes they (managers) would like to see introduced. The questionnaire covers modules/subjects such as staff appraisal, career development, training and development, general comments on organisational climate, etc. within each module. The key factors analyzed range from involvement of individual managers in decisions concerning their future to the assessment of how valuable managers find the training programme. The results from such analyses are charted and tabulated to show the variations in response by level and function of the organisation. The results can be used to monitor the effect of subsequent changes and opportunities for managers to say how useful they consider the existence of different parts of the management development system to be.

61. Management development audit does not aim at proving the effects of MD but at how to improve it. Auditing is not without its drawbacks: it provides only a broad orientation and initial data for detailed needs assessment and planning of training programmes; it is a very demanding task which requires a lot of time and resources; auditing can only be done after a long-lapse of time and as a consequence, only few studies can be undertaken.

62. The presentation ended by distinguishing between the concepts of monitoring and evaluation which were distinct from either inspection or audit. Monitoring is carried out only during implementation of a training programme. Evaluation, on the other hand, is carried out (a) during implementation (on-going evaluation);(b) at completion (terminal evaluation); and (c) some years after completion (ex-post evaluation). Both monitoring and evaluation are tools for analyzing data and producing information for decision making.

63. During the presentation, lively exchanges on the concepts of change in behaviour as opposed to change in attitude due to training, and on whether monitoring and evaluation meant the same thing or not were generated. With regard to the latter, the difference was based on the time frame; it was not possible to resolve the former. The participants just agreed to disagree.

64. In the afternoon session the question "supposing you were the Director of the Directorate for Manpower Development and Training (DMDT - Cabinet Office), what criteria/methods would you use to monitor and evaluate the various staff training programmes you sponsor overseas? (Bring out clearly the likely problems to be encountered and your

suggestions as to how to resolve these)" was discussed in plenary. The following were some of the methods suggested for monitoring:

(a) use term assessment provided by the training institutions to monitor the progress of trainees and how they are settling in. From such reports, DMDT may determine as to whether some trainees require extension of their training programmes;

(b) maintain a channel of communication between the employer and the employee who is on training so as to be informed as to what the latter is experiencing;

(c) if the training programme is donor funded through such agencies as the British Council, progress reports should be sent through such agencies (the British Council example of doing exactly this should be emulated by other donor agencies);

(d) DMDT should formulate two questionnaires, one for monitoring training institutions and another for monitoring trainees;

(e) review the curriculum of the institutes to which trainees are sent so as to determine whether these meet the requirements of the Zambian Civil-Service;

(f) periodical visits to institutions where trainees are should be made by DMDT officials so as to have on-the-spot picture as to what is going on;

(g) line ministries should submit lists of students studying in particular countries to Zambia's diplomatic missions so as to involve the latter in the monitoring process.

(h) for those students whose training lasts for at least, three years, they should be interviewed when they come home half-way through their course. Such interviews should be structured and formalised so as to get reliable information on foreign training.

65. On evaluation, the ECA resource person reminded the audience that much of the foreign training for the civil-service was basically academic education and not training in the strict sense of the word. As such, the graduates' worth could be determined by the extent to which they are able to apply the concepts, methods, etc, which they learned to the job --

especially adapting such knowledge to Zambia's socio-economic needs. The following observations were made with regard to evaluating training:

(a) evaluation of training should be done, in the civil service, at least six months after returning from training. This was considered the minimum threshold necessary to determine as to whether an individual's job performance has improved as a result of training.

(b) use interviews and questionnaire to find out how much has been learned.

(c) evaluation of training in the civil-service may be of no consequence as the effective utilization of trained personnel can be best achieved through improved conditions of service. At the moment, returning civil-servants (from training) have to apply for extra-qualification increments in their notches (steps). However, not all graduates are aware of this application and, as a consequence, some do not get such increments on time. If the salary step is near the top of a given grade, the extra-qualification increments would not lead to automatic promotion to a higher grade even if the training notching entails this.

(d) returning graduates should be given extra responsibilities in the same occupation to see how they cope and perform;

(e) the evaluation of training assumes that the high-ranking officials in the civil-service know what training was supposed to achieve in the first instance. Since manpower policy is not very clear in the Zambian Civil Service, there is little value in undertaking evaluation; and

(f) bosses who acknowledge that their subordinates can attain a level of competence to match their own are in a better position to appreciate training evaluation than those who do not.

66. The likely problems to be encountered were enumerated as follows:

(a) monitoring of foreign training cannot be continuous but periodic. In addition, the DMDT evaluator lacks knowledge of the contextual environment in which training is being undertaken;

(b) high resource costs: questionnaires need to be posted, processed and the results disseminated. In the context of current budgetary constraints, this may become a serious problem. The same is true of an official visiting the training institutions abroad as the kwacha costs of air travel is always increasing due to the depreciating exchange rate;

(c) given the high labour turnover rates in the civil-service, it may be very difficult to maintain consistency;

(d) there is a need for a feedback mechanism as the current practice of monitoring is one way. That is, the sponsoring agency through DMDT to the employing institution where the trainee comes from. The latter are just informed of what is going on with respect to their employee but with no provision for their own views.

(e) there is no clear-cut manpower policy to guide the training evaluation process.

DAY V

67. The main business of the day was to adopt the workshop draft report; evaluate and close the workshop.

ADOPTION OF THE DRAFT REPORT

68. The draft report was adopted with only one amendment.

EVALUATION OF THE WORKSHOP

69. Participants were given a short questionnaire on the various aspects of the workshop. The following were their responses:

	Very Good	Good	Satisfactory	Fair	Unsatisfactory	Total
Scheduling of work programme	7 (58)	2 (17)	2 (17)	1 (8)	-	12
Effectiveness of lectures	5 (42)	6 (50)	1 (8)	-	-	12
Effectiveness and Rating of Group Discussions	4 (33)	6 (50)	1 (8)	1 (8)	-	12

NB: Figures in parentheses are row percentages.

70. On effectiveness of lectures (that is, presentation of papers), one participant felt that the progression from one concept to another (some of which were very new) was too abrupt. Two others felt that the duration of the workshop should have been two weeks and not only one week so as to maximise the effectiveness of the workshop. Other comments on the effectiveness of lectures were as follows:

a. the lectures were rather routine as they lacked empirical evidence from Zambia or other African countries which would have made them appropriate to the group;

b. the resource person should have gone through the workshop documents page by page so as to ensure coverage of each chapter. The ECA resource person responded to this by saying that given the time constraint and the fact that the participants were expected to have gone through the material on their own, doing so would have been a waste of effort and time;

c. the workshop should have included field visits;

d. the time for each topic was too short;

On the positive side, one participant congratulated all the resource persons for a job well done. It was this participant's considered opinion that there was proper planning before and during the workshop.

71. On the effectiveness and rating of group discussions, the following comments were made:

a. two of the participants said that the some topics of discussion were not very clear and, as such, the questions were not adequately answered;[2]
b. discussions would have been enhanced under closer control and guidance. As such it took too long to reach conclusions;
c. higher authorities such as Deputy Secretary to the Cabinet (Manpower) should have been invited to group discussions so as to hear from them as to why, for example, the Zambian civil-service has no clear cut manpower policy;

72. The positive aspects of the group discussions were said to be their being well conducted and plenary sessions well presented; and the exposure to new and fruitful ideas during group discussions.

73. With regard to the question, 'how useful were the handouts?', 12 participants (86 per cent) responded that they were very useful; two (or 14 per cent) said they were useful; and none said that they were either partly or not useful at all. On the issue of whether the participants were given the opportunity to participate effectively and whether such participation was useful, eleven responded to both questions in the affirmative. No negative (no) responses were recorded. Some comments on the usefulness of the participation in the discussion by the participants were made: a refresher course/workshop was necessary so as to make a follow-up on the present workshop; there was free expression of constructive ideas; and improved learning as different experiences were shared.

74. Among the things some participants disliked most about the workshop, the absence of one local resource person on Tuesday was ranked highest. This was followed by that of few participants monopolising the discussions and that of some presentations being rushed.

75. The particular aspects of the workshop which the participants liked most include the following:

a. the presentation of lectures and effective participation of participants (two);
b. commitment of resource persons and hospitality of the local course director (two);
c. group discussions (five);
d. visual aids and instructional methods session (two); and
e. homogeneity of the group -- that is, all the participants were manpower development personnel -- made discussions lively.

---

[2]This is probably true with regard to questions on Day II of the workshop as the group reports were not very clear on the issues raised by the questions. On this basis, it was thought necessary to exclude these group reports from this report.

76. On the question of whether the participants would propose to their friends who did not attend the workshop to participate in a similar one in future, all of them said yes. The responding participants also made recommendations which could improve similar future workshops:

a. extend the workshop to two weeks (two);[3]
b. make study visits to training institutions and/or other similar institutions during such workshops (three);
c. use more teaching aids and more involvement of participants (one);
d. increase the number of local resource persons (one); and
e. make clear introduction of course content so as to determine whether the participants are all familiar with the subject at hand (one).

CLOSING OF THE WORKSHOP

77. The workshop was closed by Mr Kapila G. Kasapatu, Deputy Permanent Secretary, Centralised Recruitment Agency, Personnel Division, Cabinet Office. Before reading out his closing speech, Mr Kasapatu was asked by the local course director Mr Hamabuyu to present attendance certificates to the participants.

78. In his closing speech Mr Kasapatu started by paying tribute to the collaborative effort between NIPA and ECA in organising such an important workshop. He reiterated the importance of human resources development in the economic development of any nation. What was in doubt, however, was the amount of financial and other resources set aside to develop/train such a critical factor (human resources) of economic development. He reminded the participants that they were all too aware of how much human resources development has been given lip-service. He cited the case of the civil-service and other similar organizations where the status of the training manager/officer is lowly placed than that of other similar functional departments. Training budgets, he went on, are usually the least supported in many organisations.

79. Given the resource constraints affecting many economies in the world, it was imperative to use the little resources available more efficiently. One sure way of effectively utilising such limited resources was by investing in development and training of human

---

[3]This view was also expressed by the officials from Cabinet Office and the local course director.

resources. As long as a proper analysis of training needs is done so that people are sent for proper training, an improvement in their performance on completion of such training is likely. He then reemphasised his argument by listing the topics covered in the workshop and their importance in training management. He further said that to the extent that the topics covered in the workshop had been fully discussed in the context of Zambia's socio-economic and political context, he was confident that the participants were fully geared to revamp the training function of their various organizations in the Third Republic.[4] The revamping of the training function would be the acid test of the value of the workshop and the participants were further urged to remember that they are agents of change and should, therefore, work very hard, be knowledgeable, innovative and responsive to the ever changing socio-economic and political environment.

80. Mr Kasapatu concluded his speech by exulting the participants for their hard work and commitment during the workshop and by also expressing appreciation to the ECA, through their resource person, for having co-sponsored the workshop. He hoped that such institutional links with the ECA should be strengthened and he further urged NIPA to explore further the ways and means of strengthening this joint effort. He finally thanked the local course director, Mr Hamabuyu, for working tirelessly to ensure the smooth running of the course.

81. In a vote of thanks speech, Mrs Denise Mwanza (Training Officer, Zambia National Provident Fund), thanked other fellow participants for making the workshop such a lively event; the ECA resource person and the local course director for their commitment; and the Deputy Principal of NIPA and the course Director for the lovely hospitality NIPA extended to the participants. She also raised the issue of the need to persuade top management to regard training as an important function in organizational development and that the workshop should have been extended to two weeks so as to allow the participants to discuss in much detail the issues relating to organizational and management development.

82. With the foregoing speeches done, the workshop came to a close on Friday 20, 1991 at 14.30 hours.

---

[4]Zambia's political history is marked by phases, that is, the period from 1964 (the year of independence) to 1972 when plural politics were the order of the day was referred to as the First Republic; the period 1972 to October 31, 1991 (the day of the Multi-party general elections) when UNIP was the sole political party is referred to as the Second Republic; from November 1, 1991 onwards, the Third Republic.

APPENDIX

WORKSHOP ON MANAGEMENT AND ORGANIZATIONAL DEVELOPMENT

PROGRAMMES

LUSAKA, ZAMBIA: 16 - 20 SEPTEMBER 1991

Monday, 16 September

8.30 - 9.30	Registration of Participants
9.30 - 10.00	Official Opening of the Workshop
10.00 - 10.30	TEA BREAK
10.30 - 11.30	Management Development and Organization Development (ECA Resource Person)
11.30 - 13.00	Group Discussions:

A: In the context of Zambia's unstable and deteriorating economic situation, what are the likely consequences on management and organizational development? How can these consequences (if adverse) be mitigated?

B: In the light of the contraction of the Zambian Civil-Service, is management and organizational development possible? Discuss with a view to making policy recommendations.

13.00 - 14.00	LUNCH BREAK
14.00 - 15.00	Group Discussions (Continued)
15.00 - 15.30	TEA BREAK

15.30 - 16.30	Plenary: Presentation of Group Reports

Tuesday, 17 September

8.30 - 10.00	Planning and Implementing Staff Training Programmes (Local Resource Person)
10.00 - 10.30	TEA BREAK
10.30 - 13.00	Group Discussions:

A: What are the main considerations of the staff training programmes in the Zambian Public Sector? Do these considerations adequately meet Zambia's socio-economic needs?

B: In the context of the current budgetary constraints, it is almost impossible to plan and implement staff training programmes in the Zambian Public Sector. Discuss.

13.00 - 14.00	LUNCH BREAK
14.00 - 15.00	Group Discussions (continued)
15.00 - 15.30	TEA BREAK
15.30 - 16.30	Plenary: Presentation of Group Reports

Wednesday, 18 September 1991

8.30 - 10.00	Analysis and Determinants of Training Needs of an Organization or an Enterprise (ECA Resource Person)

10.00 - 10.30	TEA BREAK
10.30 - 13.00	Training Aids: Instructional Methods, Approaches and Techniques (Local Resource Person)
12.30 - 14.00	LUNCH BREAK
14.00 - 15.30	Demonstration of teaching/training aids in NIPA's Teaching Laboratory.
15.30 - 16.00	TEA BREAK
16.00 - 16.30	Demonstration of teaching aids (continued)

Thursday, 19, September

8.30 - 10.00	Monitoring and Evaluation of Staff Training Programmes (By ECA Resource Person)
10.00 - 10.30	TEA BREAK
10.30 - 13.00	Plenary Discussion: Supposing you were the Director of DMDT, what criteria/methods would you use to monitor and evaluate the various staff training programmes you sponsor overseas? (Bring out clearly the likely problems to be encountered and your suggestions as to how to resolve these).
12.30 - 14.00	LUNCH BREAK
14.00 - 15.30	Plenary Discussion (Continued).
15.30 - 16.00	TEA BREAK
16.00 - 16.30	Plenary: Finalisation of the Plenary Discussion.

Friday, 20 September

10.00 - 10.30	Adoption of Workshop Report
10.30 - 11.00	TEA BREAK
11.00 - 11.30	Evaluation of Workshop
13.00 - 14.00	LUNCH BREAK
14.00 - 15.00	Presentation of Attendance certificates and Closing of Workshop

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

1. Mr Nicholas Hansingo, Principal, Natural Resources Development College, P.O. Box 31099, Lusaka, Tel. 281227/8.

2. Mrs Ethel Namakau Muntanga, Senior Manpower Development Officer, Ministry of Agriculture, P.O. Box 50197, Lusaka, Tel. 252679.

3. Mr Evaristo Chewe, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, P.O. Box 50069, Lusaka, Tel. 252979.

4. Mr Neckson G. Mphande, Lecturer (Secretarial Studies), Zimco Institute of Management, P.O. Box 31735, Lusaka, Tel. 278575/278699.

5. Mr Pickford Robert Mvula, Senior Manpower Development Officer, Directorate of Manpower Development and Training, P.O. Box 50340, Lusaka, Tel. 252704.

6. Mr Abel Mubanga Pandawa, Lecturer, ZIMCO Institute of Management, P.O. Box 31735, Lusaka, Tel. 246404/246248, Telex 40790/40307.

7. Mrs Esther Mbao Kapatamoyo, Chief Manpower Development officer, Ministry of Health, P.O. Box 30205, Lusaka, Tel. 225785.

8. Mr Amos M. Hamadulu, Senior Manpower Development officer, Ministry of Legal Affairs, P.O. Box 50106, Lusaka, Tel. 228522.

9. Mrs Florence K. Mumbi, Senior Personnel Officer (Administration), Mwaiseni Stores Ltd., P.O. Box 32285, Lusaka, Tel. 227771/4.

10. Mr Henry A. Muyenga, Director (Training), Office of the President, P.O. Box 50212, Lusaka, Tel. 264762.

11. Mr Charles Mulemwa, Senior Personnel and Training Officer, Mwaiseni Stores Ltd., P.O. Box 32285, Lusaka, Tel. 227771/4.

12. Mr Elijah Muleya, Consultant, Management Services Board, P.O. Box 50995, Lusaka, Tel. 253182/253055, Telex. 40237.

13. Mrs Denise C. Mwanza, Training Officer, Zambia National Provident Fund, P.O. Box 33790, Lusaka, Tel. 225226/228046/54.

14. Mr James Kanga, Chief Manpower Development Officer, Office of the Member of the Central Committee, Lusaka Province, P.O. Box 34430, Lusaka, Tel. 227621/6.

RESOURCE PERSONS:

1. Dr Mushiba Nyamazana, Public Administration, Human Resources and Social Development Division, Economic Commission for Africa, P.O. Box 3005, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. Tel. 251-1-517200; Telex 21029 UNECA ET; Fax 251-1-514416.

2. Mr Coillard C. Hamabuyu, (Local Course Director) Lecturer, NIPA, P.O. Box 31990, Lusaka, Tel. 228880/4,213121, Telex 40523.

3. Mrs Silumesii, Secretary, NIPA.